Spring 2017

ID 258--Special Topics: Beyond Tokenism: Indigenizing, Feminizing, Queering Development

Amber Murrey
amurrey@clarku.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://commons.clarku.edu/syllabi

<div align="center">

Beyond Tokenism:
Indigenizing, Feminizing, Queering Development

INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT, COMMUNITY & ENVIRONMENT
Clark University
Spring 2017

</div>

Instructor:	**Dr. Amber Murrey**	*Email*:	amurrey@clarku.edu
Office:	4th floor IDCE, Rm 41	*Phone*:	508-421-3839

Class meets:
Classroom:

Course Description

International development has been an overwhelmingly white, heteronormative, and patriarchal project. That is to say, it has been informed ideologically, epistemologically, and in practice by hegemonic Eurocentric norms, priorities, and "expert knowledge." In this course, we focus our attention on the shifting but near-permanent criticisms of normative, hegemonic development projects articulated by LGBTQ people, people of color, Indigenous scholars and activists, Pan-Africanists and African feminists, transnational feminists, Chicano/a historians, and more. We give particular attention to elucidating alternative imaginaries of "progress," "empowerment," and "development" for meaningful, livable futures that emphasize wellbeing, ecological balance, and buen vivir. In this way, the course is explicitly forward-looking as we seek to move beyond critique towards the active imagining of new horizons.

Context: The Rise of Ideologies of Inclusiveness

Powerful critiques of development as Euro-normative have occurred alongside the rising international visibility of the limitations of Euro-hegemonic approaches to human development, including widespread direct protests by dissatisfied people against development projects in their communities. In response to critiques that development unfolds within Eurocentric frameworks, the last three decades have witnessed diverse efforts to incorporate gender sensitivity and to incorporate "traditional knowledge" within development frameworks. However, these specious attempts to alter development's deeply rooted Eurocentricism have been challenged as superficial forms of "tokenism": little more than symbolic displays of inclusion that do not alter political or economic structures nor the power imbalances that they (re)produce.

During this course, students become familiar with critical development studies and post-development literatures as we examine the political, social, and ecological contexts in which hegemonic claims to legitimacy and authenticity based on proximity to or proficiency in "Indigenous," "African," and "local" knowledge(s) emerge. That is to say, we look at case studies in which highly publicized (gender, local, sexual) inclusiveness is

an ideological tool.

At the same time, the World Bank, DFID, USAID, and other major international development agencies are increasingly training and educating development actors based in the countries of the so-called global South. Frequent workshops and seminars cultivate particular depoliticized approaches to development, reproduce normative standards, and, while sometimes revised for local contexts, these knowledge transfer projects muddle any simplistic notion that countries of the south pursue purely "non-Western" development frameworks. The rise of BRICS likewise illustrates the limitations of binary thinking that would posit all development from the Southern countries as somehow more benevolent. Our examination will be alert to these distinctions and nuanced contexts and will avoid a romanticization of oppressed and exploited people and places. We will be attentive to dissimilar voices on the margins of development practice: women, LGBTQ, Indigenous, and differently abled people.

Learning Outcomes

By the end of the semester, participants in this course will be able to:
- Reflect (with a high degree of analytical clarity) on and provide a critique of Euro-normativity in development studies and development practice
- Respond with lucidity and humble confidence (in both written and oral forms of communication) to questions about development epistemologies, positionality, Indigeneity, identity politics, representation, and historical shifts in development approaches
- Formulate strong and articulate arguments about the intersections between development practice and political, social, cultural, and ecological contexts
- Work collaboratively to create communities (or collectives) for engaged and sustained learning, this includes co-authoring, peer reviewing, and engaging in respectful communication
- Fulfill their own individual goal(s) for the course (established by each learner at the beginning of the semester)

In this course, we will read <u>sections</u> of the following texts. All texts will be on reserve at Goddard Library throughout the semester.

- Nagar, Richa and Collective. <u>Playing with Fire: Feminist thought and activism through seven lives in India</u>. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Bond, Patrick and Ana Garcia (eds.). <u>BRICS: An Anti-Capitalist Critique</u>.
- Lind, Amy (2010) <u>Development, Sexual Rights and Global Governance</u>. Routledge.
- Tandon, Yash (2008) <u>Ending Aid Dependence</u>. Dakar, Nairobi, Oxford: Fahamu.
- Bernal, Victoria and Inderpal Grewal (eds.) (2014) <u>Theorizing NGOs: States, Feminisms, and Neoliberalism</u>. Duke University Press.

Recommended (not required):
- Peet, R. and Hartwick, E. (2009) <u>Theories of Development</u>, 2nd Edition (New

York: The Guilford Press).
- Sheppard, E. et al. (2009) <u>A World of Difference: Encountering and Contesting Development</u>, 2nd Edition (New York: The Guilford Press).
- Chari, Sharad and Stuart Corbridge (eds.) (2008) <u>The Development Reader</u> (London and New York: Routledge).
- Rahnema, Majid and Victoria Bawtree (eds.). (1997) <u>The Post-Development Reader</u>. Zed Books.
- Carmody, Pádraig. <u>The Rise of the BRICS in Africa</u>.
- Galeano, Eduardo (1997) <u>Open Veins of Latin America: Five Centuries of the Pillage of a Continent.</u> Monthly Review Press.
- Li, Tania Murray. (2007) <u>The Will to Improve: Governmentality, Development, and the Practice of Politics</u> (Durham: Duke University Press).
- Mitchell, Timothy. 2002. <u>Rule of Experts: Egypt, Techno-Politics, Modernity</u> (Berkeley: University of California Press).
- Simpson, Audra (2014) <u>Mohawk Interruptus: Political Life Across the Borders of Settler States</u>. Duke University Press.
- Bhavnani, Kum-Kum, John Foran, Priya A. Kurian, and Debashish Munshi (2016) <u>Feminizing Futures: Reimagining Women, Culture and Development</u>. University of Chicago Press.

Course Format

1.   **Attendance**: Guidelines to be determined collectively.

2.   **Readings:** Guidelines to be determined collectively.

3.   **Participation**: Guidelines to be determined collectively.

4.   **Assessments**: 50% to be determined by the collective; 50% determined by the course leader.

The intentions of this course are to establish a collective of engaged learners who are passionate about and committed to, in various ways, the pursuit of knowledge for social justice. Inspired by critical pedagogies of bell hooks and Paulo Freire, I have tried to weave flexibility and attention to learners' educational needs within our course structure. We will engage together and we will learn together. As such, this syllabus is a living document that will be worked and reworked throughout our time together. There will be moments when we decide as a collective to pursue new topics that were not originally scheduled and/or to drop or alter others.

Projects to decolonize knowledge are founded on the active engagement of the learners in the knowledge creation project. This involves collective and active construction of key elements of the course structure and the arrangement of our engagements in and out of the classroom. During our first couple of meetings and based on the learners' objectives, interests, and experiences, the collective will determine 50% of the course assessments (such assessments might include a final written project or a daily diary or the filming of a short video clip or writing an original song, for example). These

additional assessments will then be posted on the course Moodle page once the collective has agreed upon the requirements.

Grade Breakdown

To be determined by the collective	50%
Presentation & Discussion Facilitation	25%
Daily Reading Reflections	15%
Midterm Exam	5%
Final Exam	5%

Note: Graduate learners are required to deliver two oral presentations per semester. Undergraduate learners will deliver one.

Presentation & Discussion Facilitation

Each learner will deliver one 25-minute oral presentation and facilitate the subsequent class discussion for approximately 20 minutes (graduate students will deliver two presentations throughout the semester). Presentations will address the theme for the given week and will illustrate considerable breadth and depth of reflection. Each week on the syllabus has 1 or 2 additional reading sources listed; the presenter for each week will read these additional materials, which will add substance to the week's discussion. Presentations will introduce the theme and engage contextually and critically with it. Learners will compose two questions that will lead into the class discussion. Questions for the discussion facilitation will focus in on specific aspects of the texts for the week (rather than asking broad questions). Presentations are an opportunity for learners to lead us in our daily collective knowledge creation. I encourage learners to be innovative, discerning, and even radical in engagements with the readings. A grading rubric for presentations will be circulated and posted on Moodle.

Daily Reading Reflections

This is a reading intensive course. To encourage critical thinking and reflection upon the readings, learners will upload a 2 page (single-space, Times, 12-point font) reflection on the day's reading by 8am on the day that the class is scheduled to meet. Learners are encouraged to address topics discussed in their reflections with the collective, when appropriate. Reflections should not be mere summations of our materials; rather, they will demonstrate original, critical thinking as the learners make connections between different authors and themes from week-to-week and interpret the readings through their various positionalities and/or engagements with social justice. These written reflections are opportunities for learners to delve into particular aspects of the readings that are of particular interest for the learner.

Exams

There will be two exams for this course. These exams will be composed of short and long written responses to questions based on lectures, discussions, and materials

(including videos and readings). These exams are not intended to test learners' abilities to summarize or memorize information. Rather, each exam will look at learners' abilities to: make broad connections between themes and readings, elucidate major arguments of key texts, and articulate original ideas. Each exam will take approximately 60 minutes.

Disabilities

If you need assistance or appropriate academic accommodations for a disability or other issue, please contact me after class or via email.

Academic Integrity

As with each course offered at Clark, students are expected to adhere to the university's Academic Honor Code. Be sensitive to issues of plagiarism and be sure to credit the work of others in your writing. If you have questions about citations, there are many comprehensive academic guidelines on plagiarism and how to avoid it available online.

Course Schedule
(Subject to change upon notification)

WEEK 1 → Introduction to Core Arguments
- Briggs, John and Joanne Sharp. (2004) Indigenous Knowledges and Development: A Postcolonial Caution. *Third World Quarterly*, Vol. 25, No. 4, pp. 661-676.
- McFadden, Patricia (2010) Challenging "Empowerment." *Development, suppl. Gender and Empowerment*, pp. 161-164.
- Grech, Shaun (2008) Disability, Poverty and Development: Critical Reflections on Majority World Debate. *Disability & Society*, 6, pp. 771-784.
- Nyamnjoh, Francis (2011) Relevant Education for African Development: Some Epistemological Considerations. In *Philosophy and African Development: Theory and Practice*, pp. 139-154.

WEEK 2 → Critiquing Development
- Shivji I G (2006) The silences in the NGO discourse: the role and future of NGOs in Africa. *Africa Development* XXXI(4), 22-51.
- Ake, Claude (1996) Chapter 1 in <u>Democracy and Development in Africa</u>. Brookings Institute Press.
  - In Class (film): Watch sections of John Pilger's "War by Other Means—IMF and the World Bank." Available: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=79bZ71fUZRU

Presenter:
- Rahnema, Majid and Victoria Bawtree (1997) "Introduction" in <u>The Post-Development Reader</u>. Zed Books

- Escobar A (1995) "The Problematization of Poverty: The Tale of Three Worlds and Development" in *Encountering Development: The Making and Unmaking of the Third World.* Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.

WEEK 3 → "Dangerous" Development: Sovereignty, Ending Aid, Reparations
- Tandon, Yash. (2008) Chapters 1, 2, and 3 of <u>Ending Aid Dependence</u>. Fahamu.
- Ibhawho, Bonny and J. I. Dibua (2003) Deconstructing Ujamaa: The Legacy of Julius Nyerere in the Quest for Social and Economic Development in Africa. *Africa Journal Political Science* 8(1).
- Coates, Ta-Nehisi (2014) The Case for Reparations. *The Atlantic.* Available at: http://www.theatlantic.com/magazine/archive/2014/06/the-case-for-reparations/361631/
- Sankara, Thomas. Select Speeches. In <u>Thomas Sankara Speaks</u>.
    - <u>In Class</u> (film): Watch sections of "The Upright Man."

Presenter:
- Tandon, Yash. (2008) <u>Ending Aid Dependence</u>. Fahamu.

WEEK 4 → Hegemonic Appropriations & Ambivalences of "Indigenous Knowledge"
- Mohan G, Stokke K (2000) Participatory development and empowerment: the dangers of localism. *Third World Quarterly* 21(2), 247-268.
- World Bank Pamphlet: Indigenous Knowledge (IK) Project by Nicolas Gorjestani. Available at: http://www.worldbank.org/afr/ik/ikpaper_0102.pdf
- World Bank Report: Indigenous Knoweldge for Development: A Framework For Action (1998) "What is Indignous Knowledge?" and "Why is Indigenous Knoweldge Important?" and skim the rest. Available: http://www.worldbank.org/afr/ik/ikrept.pdf
    - <u>In Class</u> (Lecture): Case study of the Chad-Cameroon Oil Pipeline

Presenter (choose two)*:*
- Murray Li T (2004) Environmentalism, indigeneity and transnationalism. In *Liberation Ecologies: Environment, Development, Social Movements*, Peet R, Watts M (eds), Second Edition, 339-370. New York: Routledge.
- Gibson-Graham, J. K. (2003) Toward an Ethics of the Local. *Rethinking Marxism* 15, no. 1: 49-74.
- Laurie, Nina and Robert Andolina, Sarah Radcliffe (2005) Ethnodevelopment: Social Movements, Creating Experts and Professionalising Indigenous Knowledge in Ecuador. *Antipode* pp. 470-496.

WEEK 5 → Spirituality, Witchcraft, & Development
- Nyamnjoh, Francis. (2001) Chapter 2 in <u>Magical Interpretations, Material Realities: Modernity, Witchcraft and the Occult in Postcolonial Africa</u>. Moore and Sanders (eds.)
- Murrey, Amber (2015) Invisible Power, Visible Dispossession: The Witchcraft of a Subterranean Oil Pipeline. *Political Geography*, pp. 64-76.

Presenter:

- Smith, James Howard (2008) "Development's Other: Witchcraft as Development through the Looking Glass" and "Conclusion: Temporalities, Or Why Development Should Not be Defined as the Improvement of Living Standards" in <u>Bewitching Development: Witchcraft and the Reinvention of Development in Neoliberal Kenya</u>. The University of Chicago Press.

WEEK 6 → Indigenizing the Future
- Oppong, Seth (2000) Indigenizing Knoweldge for Development: Epistemological and Pedagogical Approaches. *Africanus* 43(2), pp. 34-50.
- Le Grange, Lesley (2012) *Ubuntu, Ukama* and the Healing of Nature, Self Society. *Educational Philosophy and Theory* d44(S2).
- Merino, Roger (2016) An alternative to 'alternative development'?: Buen vivir and human development in Andean countries. *Oxford Development Studies* 44(3).

Presenter (choose two)*:*
- Marquina-Márquez, Alfonso**,** Virchez, Jorge, Ruiz-Callado, Raúl (2016) Postcolonial **healing** landscapes and mental health in a remote Indigenous community in subarctic Ontario, Canada. *Polar Geography* 39(1), pp. 20-39.
- Senier, Siobhan **(2013)** 'Traditionally, disability was not seen as such': writing and **healing** in the work of Mohegan medicine people. Journal of Literary & Cultural Disability Studies 7(2), pp. 213 – 217.
- Boyd, Colleen E. (2009) "You See Your Culture Coming Out of the Ground Like a Power": Uncanny Narratives in Time and Space on the Northwest Coast" in *Ethnohistory* 54(4).

WEEK 7 → Feminizing Poverty, Feminizing Development: Contemporary Debates
- Leve, Lauren (2014) "Failed Development and Rural Revolution in Nepal: Rethinking Subaltern Consciousness and Women's Empowerment" in <u>Theorizing NGOs: States, Feminisms, and Neoliberalism,</u> Bernal, Victoria and Inderpal Grewal (eds.). Duke University Press.
- Karim, Lamia (2014) "Demystifying MicroCredit: The Grameen Bank, NGOs, and Neoliberalism in Bangladesh" in <u>Theorizing NGOs: States, Feminisms, and Neoliberalism,</u> Bernal, Victoria and Inderpal Grewal (eds.). Duke University Press.
  - <u>In Class</u> (film clip): Watch promotional video for Nike Girl Campaign

Presenter:
- Collins, Patricia Hill (1986) The Outsider Within: The Sociological Significance of Black Feminist Thought. *Social Theory* 33(6), pp. S14-S32.
- Daley, Patricia (2008) Chapter 1 in <u>Gender and Genocide in Burundi: The Search for Spaces of Peace in the Great Lakes Region</u>.

→ Mid-Term Exam (approximately 60 minutes)

WEEK 8 → Women Strike Back
- Keisha-Khan Y. Perry. (2009) "If We Didn't Have Water": Black Women's Struggle for Urban Land Rights in Brazil. *Environmental Justice* 2(1), pp. 9-14.

- Nagar, Richa and Collective. (2006) "Introduction. Playing with Fire: A Collective Journey," "The Beginnings of a Collective Journey," "Challenges of NGOization and Dreams of Sangtin" and "Postscript: NGOs, Global Feminisms, and Collaborative Border Crossings" in <u>Playing with Fire: Feminist thought and activism through seven lives in India</u>. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

WEEK 9 → Feminizing Development Futures
- Alvarez, Sonia E. (2016) "Beyond NGOization? Reflections from Latin America" in <u>Theorizing NGOs: States, Feminisms, and Neoliberalism,</u> Bernal, Victoria and Inderpal Grewal (eds.). Duke University Press.
- Garland-Thomson, Rosmarie (2005) Feminist Disability Studies. *Signs* 30(2), pp. 1557-1587.
- Seppälä, Tiina (2016) Feminizing Resistance, Decolonizing Solidarity: Contesting Neoliberal Development in the Global South. *Journal of Resistance Studies* 1(2), pp. 12-47.
- McFadden, Patricia (2000) Globalizing Resistance: Crafting and Strengthening African Feminist Solidarities. *The Black Scholar* 38(2-3), pp. 19-20.

Presenter:
- Valentine, Shari and Henderson, Kathryn (2009) Appropriation and Marginalization: An Indigenous Examination of Ecofeminism. *Conference Papers -- American Sociological Association.* 2009 Annual Meeting, pp. 1 – 20.

WEEK 10 → Queering Development
- Susie Jolly (2000) 'Queering' Development: Exploring the Links between Same-Sex Sexualities, Gender, and Development. *Gender and Development* Vol. 8, No. 1, pp. 78-88
- Lind, Amy (2010) "Introduction: Development, Global Governance, and Sexual Subjectivities" in <u>Development, Sexual Rights and Global Governance</u>. Routledge, pp. 1-20.
- Bedford, Kate (2010) "Promoting exports, restructuring love: The World Bank and the Ecuadorian Flower Industry" in <u>Development, Sexual Rights and Global Governance.</u> Routledge, pp. 99-112.

Presenter:
- Bergeron, Suzanne (2010) "Querying Feminist Economics' Straight Path to Development: Household Models Reconsidered" in <u>Development, Sexual Rights and Global Governance.</u> Routledge, pp. 54-64.

WEEK 11 → Queering Development Futures
- Driskill, Qwo-Li, Chris Finley, Brian Joseph Giley, and Scott Lauria Morgensen (2011) "The Revolution is for Everyone: Imagining an Emancipatory Future through Queer Indigenous Crital Theories" in <u>Queer Indigenous Studies: Critical Interventions in Theory, Politics</u>, Driskill, Qwo-Li (ed.), pp. 211-222.
- Doan, Petra (2010) "Disrupting Gender Normativity in the Middle East: Supporting Gender Transgression as a Development Strategy" in <u>Development, Sexual Rights and Global Governance.</u> Routledge, pp. 145-154.

WEEK 12 → LGBTQ Activism in Transnational Context

- King, Hilary. (2014) Queers of War: Normalizing Gays and Lesbians in the US War Machine, in <u>Good Intentions: Norms and Practices of Imperial Humanitarianism</u>. Forte, Maximilian (ed.).
- Currier, Ashley (2010) "Behind the Mask: Developing LGBTI Visibility in Africa" in <u>Development, Sexual Rights and Global Governance.</u> Routledge, pp. 155-168.
    - <u>In Class</u> (film): Documentary on Ugandan and Cameroonian LGBTQ community

Presenter:

- Rachel Bergenfield and Alice M. Miller. Queering International Development?: An Examination of New "LGBT Rights" Rhetoric, Policy, and Programming among International Development Agencies.

WEEK 13 → Problematizing the North/South Epistemic Divide: Troubling South-South Relations

- Prashad, Vijay (2015)"Does the South have a possible history?" in <u>BRICS: An Anti-Capitalist Critique</u>, Bond, Patrick and Ana Garcia (eds.).
- Marshall, Judith (2015) "Behind the Image of South-South Solidarity at Brazil's Vale" in <u>BRICS: An Anti-Capitalist Critique</u>, Bond, Patrick and Ana Garcia (eds.).
- Garcia, Ana and Patrick Bond (2015) "Introduction" in <u>BRICS: An Anti-Capitalist Critique</u>, Bond, Patrick and Ana Garcia (eds.).

Presenter (choose two):

- Panitch, Leo (2015) "BRICS, the G20 and the American Empire" in <u>BRICS: An Anti-Capitalist Critique</u>, Bond, Patrick and Ana Garcia (eds.).
- Garcia, Ana and Karina Kato (2015) "The Story of the Hunter or the Hunted? Brazil's Role in Angola and Mozambique" in <u>BRICS: An Anti-Capitalist Critique</u>, Bond, Patrick and Ana Garcia (eds.).
- Martinez, Omar Bonilla (2015) "China's Geopolitical Oil Strategy in the Andean Region" in <u>BRICS: An Anti-Capitalist Critique</u>, Bond, Patrick and Ana Garcia (eds.).
- Wallerstein, Immanuel (2015) "Whose Interests Are Served By the BRICS?" in <u>BRICS: An Anti-Capitalist Critique</u>, Bond, Patrick and Ana Garcia (eds.).

WEEK 14 → Problematizing the North/South Epistemic Divide: Hegemonic Knowledge Transfers

- World Bank and IFI training programs; look at WB websites
- Ocampo, Elizabeth and Dean Neu (2008) Chapter 1 in <u>Doing Missionary Work: The World Bank and the Diffusion of Financial Practices.</u> Fernwood Publishing Co.
- Sande Lie, Jon Harald (2015) "Developmentality" and "A Metamorphosis of Power Relations? Aid Architecture, Partnership and the State" in <u>Developmentality: An Ethnography of the World Bank-Uganda Partnership</u>. Berghahan Books.

- Goldman, Michael (2001) The Birth of a Discipline: Producing Authoritative Green Knoweldge Bank-Style. *Ethnography* 2(2), pp. 1466-1318.

Presenter:
- "A Meeting of Partners: Developmentaltiy as Seen From Uganda" in <u>Developmentality: An Ethnography of the World Bank-Uganda Partnership</u>. Berghahan Books.

WEEK 15 → Daring to Invent the Future
- Peets, Richard (2015) "For Politics" in <u>Two Cheers for Anarchism: Six Peieces on Autonomy, Dignity, and Meaningful Work</u>.
- Dhamoon, Rita (2015) A Feminist Approach to Decolonizing Anti-Racism: Rethinking Transnationalism, Intersectionality, and Settler Colonialism. *Feral Feminisms* 4, pp. 20-37.
- Gudynas, Eduardo (2011) Buen Vicir: Today's Tomorrow. *Development* 54(4), pp. 441-447.

WEEK 16 → Final exam (60 minutes)