

Clark University

Clark Digital Commons

The Rise and Development of the
Congregational Polity and Spirit in New England

History Manuscripts, -1907

March 2022

Lecture Nine: Thomas Paine and Theology Without the Church

Earl Clement Davis

Follow this and additional works at: https://commons.clarku.edu/history_manuscripts_2

Recommended Citation

Davis, Earl Clement, "Lecture Nine: Thomas Paine and Theology Without the Church" (2022). *The Rise and Development of the Congregational Polity and Spirit in New England*. 9.

https://commons.clarku.edu/history_manuscripts_2/9

This Lecture is brought to you for free and open access by the History Manuscripts, -1907 at Clark Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in The Rise and Development of the Congregational Polity and Spirit in New England by an authorized administrator of Clark Digital Commons. For more information, please contact larobinson@clarku.edu, cstebbins@clarku.edu.

Thomas Paine, and Theology without
the Church.

In studying any development of religious thought, or any other movement for that matter, there is always a danger of becoming too narrow in the range of material. We make use of, and in neglecting, the strong side lights which may be thrown upon the movement by the investigation of that material which seems to lie just outside the limits of the Centre. So many, I suppose, Thomas Paine would hardly be regarded as an enriching source for material upon theological subjects. Yet, in spite of his errors, in spite of the many mistakes that Paine made in his theological writings due to his lack of knowledge and culture. in spite of the occasional traces of coarseness, and crudeness, he struck at the very heart of many of the followers

that ^{have} flexed many minds since his day,²
and the best and most scholarly results of
modern historical investigation have
gone to confirm and fix many of the
statements made by Paine. Even the
conservative religious thinkers accept more
parts of the new volume than made Paine
write his "Age of Reason", than Paine ever
dreamed of. They still retain a semblance
of belief in those ideas which Paine's greater
personal independence lead him to reject.
While the fogs that were written in
denunciation of Paine and his ideas
have long since been forgotten, the essential
truths for which Paine stood have received
the approval of history, and are in many
ways in complete accord with modern
thought.

Born in the year, England, June 29, 1737.
He lead a turbulent life ~~to~~ filled

with bitter disappointments, until ~~the~~ he ³
came to America in 1773, bringing as his
passport into American life, a letter written
by Benjamin Franklin. In 1776 he wrote
his famous, and what proved to be his
sensational "Common Sense", in which he
boldly announced that separation from
the mother country was the only method
of dignity or safety in solving the pressing
problem which confronted the colonies
in those days. Then followed the numbers
of the "Crisis," which were well accepted to
the problems of the day. He remained in this
country until 1787, when he went to France
and England to exhibit a model of a bridge
he had invented. Arriving in France he
found the people just on the point of breaking
into the revolution, and entered into the
revolutionary movement, being of a

4.

less fanimote and extreme nature than the
leaders of the Revolution, as seen particularly
in his voting for the King's banishment,
rather than for his death, he was thrown
Luxemburg Prison. On his way to Prison
he put into ~~the~~ the hands of a publisher
the first part of ^{his} "Age of Reason." The second part was
finished in 1795; The book was dedicated
to ~~the~~ the American People, and the demand
there was for it, and the extent to which
it pervaded the country, which was laying
for some quickening nourishment to
relieve it from the ~~death of~~ death of
spiritual force brought about by Calvinism
is clearly set forth in the following words
of John White Chadwick. "The age of
Reason, letters, fragments, every thing
that he ever wrote of a theological
character, does not wake of three

hunched foges. A little craft! and yet⁵
it has outlined storms in which whole
fleets of of seventy four have gone to
wreck, and still keeps the seas and fires
its saucy challenge across many a fonder
our won: of: war and fearful merchantmen.
Seldom have these hunched foges lived so
long, and gone so far, and had so large
an influence whether for good or for evil.
In the last years of the eighteenth century
and in the first years of the nineteenth,
they were widely read in England and
America. They raised up hosts of advocates
in every town and village, worthy hard-
headed men with little poetry or imagin-
ation in them, and little pity, whatever of
sound morality. They were hated to the
revolting confines of civilization. They
penetrated to the revolting confines of
civilization. The wondering feller

carried them in his pack to the back-⁶
woodsman in his cabin. And they still
sell, especially in the Great West, hundreds
and thousands of them every year, and
are still widely read with various degrees
of satisfaction."

This is a more operative estimate of
Paine's theological influence, than he has at
times been accorded. For example on the
fly leaf of the copy of the Age of Reason which
is in the library here, are written these words.
"It is bitterly to be deplored, that the genius
which formed 'Common Sense,' 'the Crisis'
and 'Rights of man' should have ever befouled
itself with the obscenity and ribaldry
of the 'Age of Reason' and similar books."

One young Methodist preacher arriving in
this country from England, expressed
himself in these words. "I thank God

that the bones of Lou Paine have been ⁷
rooted up, and no longer disgrace the
soil of our country," I cannot refrain
also from quoting the following which
is a master piece of inconsistency. She writes
is speaking of Westchester County. "Here is found
the delight for villages where the pious but
persecuted Huguenots, fleeing from oppressions
of bigotry and intolerance, found a quiet
and happy home: and where too is still pointed
out the consecrated little enclosure, in which
when the toil and sufferings of this life
were over, they rested from their labors.
And here, alas! that the place should be
known but to be shunned, - here is yet
seen the ruins of the sad and forsaken
spot rendered infamous by the selfishness
of the infidel Paine."

Works of J. Paine. Pub. by Wm.
Carey 1830 Preface P XII

But really what is there in this "Age of Reason" &
that brought upon the heels of its writer the
denunciations of the Christian Community?
Nothing so very startling after all. I quote
his statement of belief, at least its positive
side.

"I believe in one God, and no more; and I
hope for happiness beyond this life.

"I believe in the equality of man; and I
believe that religious duties consist in doing
justice, loving mercy, and endeavoring to
waken our fellow creatures to it."

His conception of God was far more noble
and exalted than the notions prevailing
among the rank and file of the clergy
who condemned him, and his faith much
more sound and unassailable. Why he
was ever spoken of as an infidel one
cannot see, unless it be because he
really struck home at the vulnerable

joint in the accepted faith of the clergy. 9

The following sentence gives us at once a clue to the cause of the unsympathetic treatment which he received at the hands of the clergy, and also shows us the loftiness of his ideas concerning Jesus.

"The Christian Theory is little less else than the idolotry of the ancient Theologists, accorded to the purposes of power and revenue; and it yet remains to reason and Philosophy to abolish the awful and fraudulent."

Nothing that is here said can apply, even with the most distant disrespect, to the real character of Jesus Christ. He was a mixture, and an amiable one. The morality that he preached and practised was of the most benevolent kind; and through similar systems of morality had

70

been preached by Eufrasier, and by some
of the Greek Philosophers, many years
before, and by the Greeks since, and
by many good men in all ages, it has not
been exceeded by any."

A very just, and appreciative statement
of Jesus, and one which has the merit of
being quite free from gush.

Thus it seems that in general Sam Paine
held views which are very acceptable to day
to a very large number of people, and one
can express these views without fear of
such painful criticisms as were poured on Paine.
The ideas which he advanced, represented the
opinions of large numbers of people outside
of the church. They have to a very large
extent been taken up into the church beliefs
and represent the liberal branches of almost
all religious bodies, as well as the ideas

of those who are openly and avowedly liberal. "11

^{Just} As only do these ideas represent the religious opinions of the American movement outside of the church, but they are the essential principles upon which the American Government was founded, I quote "The religious opinions of Jefferson, John Adams, Benjamin Franklin and a host of other wise and good men in Europe and America, differ in no respect from those of Stow or Paine." With these men Paine was intimate, and in connection with them did merit to organize and launch this United States of America upon her course, defending not only political freedom, and religious toleration but insisting upon religious freedom, and the right of private interpretation of religious experience. When we read in

12
our constitution, - "but no religious test shall
ever be required as a qualification to any
office or public trust under the United States,"
it represents the influence of men who were
in hearty and cordial sympathy with the
ideas of natural religion, which were funda-
mental with the men of former who framed
our constitution,

This current of religious thought, outside
of the church is one of the most important,
if not the most important in the religious
development of the country, and the fulfill-
ment of its prophetic character is being
demonstrated each day of our national life.

[Rise and Development of the Congregational Polity and Spirit]

[IX.] Thomas Paine and Theology Without the Church

Earl C. Davis

Pittsfield, MA

No Date¹

In studying any development of the religious thought, or any other movement for that matter, there is always a danger of becoming too narrow in the range of material made use of, and in neglecting the strong side-lights which may be thrown upon the movement by the investigation of that material which seems to lie just outside the limits of the canon. To many, I suppose, Thomas Paine would hardly be regarded as an enriching source for material upon theological subjects. Yet, in spite of his errors, in spite [of] the many mistakes that Paine made in his theological writings due to his lack of knowledge and culture, in spite of the occasional traces of coarseness and crudeness, he struck at the very heart of many of the problems that have perplexed many minds since his day, and the best and most scholarly results of modern historical investigation have gone to confirm and prove many of the statements made by Paine. Even the conservative religious thinkers accept more facts of the very nature that made Paine write his *Age of Reason* than Paine ever dreamed of. They still retain a semblance of belief in those ideas which Paine's greater personal independence led him to reject. While the pages that were written in denunciation of Paine and his ideas have long since been forgotten, the essential truths for which Paine stood have received the approval of history, and are, in many ways, in complete accord with modern thought.

¹ Earl C. Davis wrote a good number of manuscripts concerning the history of the church. All are hand-written dating them before 1907—so Pittsfield or Harvard. Some, including this one, are pretty clearly part of a series provided to a congregation—so probably Pittsfield.

Born in Thetford, England, June 29, 1737, he led a turbulent life filled with bitter disappointments until he came to America in 1775, bringing as his passport into American life a letter written by Benjamin Franklin. In 1776, he wrote his famous, and what proved to be his sensational, "Common Sense," in which he boldly announced that the separation from the mother country was the only method of dignity or safety in solving the pressing problem which confronted the colonies in those days. Then followed the {??} of the "Crisis," which were well-adopted to the problems of the day. He remained in this country until 1787, when he went to France and England to exhibit a model of a bridge he had invented. Arriving in France he found the people just on the point of breaking into the revolution, and entered into the revolutionary movement. Being of a less passionate and extreme nature than the leaders of the [French] Revolution, as seen particularly in his voting for the King's banishment, rather than for his death, he was thrown [into] Luxembourg Prison. On his way to prison he put into the hands of a publisher the first part of his *Age of Reason*. The second part was finished in 1795. The book was dedicated to the American People, and the demand there was for it, and the extent to which it pervaded the country, which was longing for some quickening nourishment to relieve it from the dearth of spiritual force brought about by Calvinism, is clearly set forth in the following words of John White Chadwick,

The *Age of Reason*, letters, fragments, everything that he ever wrote of a theological character, does not make up three hundred pages. A little craft, and yet it has outlived storms in which whole fleets of seventy-fours have gone to wreck, and still keep the seas and fires its saucy challenge across many a founders man-of-war and peaceful merchantmen. Seldom have three hundred pages lived so long, and gone so far, and had so large an influence, whether for good or for evil. In the last years of the eighteenth century and in the first years of the nineteenth, they were widely read in England and America. They raised up knots of advocates in every town and village, mostly hard-headed men with little poetry or imagination in them, and little piety, whatever of sound morality. They penetrated to the

remotest confines of civilization. The wandering peddler carried them in his pack to the back woodsman in his cabin. And they still sell, especially in the Great West, hundreds and thousands of them every year, and are still widely read with various degrees of satisfaction.²

This is a more appreciative estimate of Paine's theological influence than he has at times been accorded. For example, on the flyleaf of the copy of the *Age of Reason* which is in the library here are written these words, "It is bitterly to be deplored that the genius which penned 'Common Sense,' 'The Crisis' and 'Lights of Man' should have even befouled itself with the obscenity and ribaldry of the *Age of Reason* and similar books." One young Methodist preacher arriving in this country from England expressed himself in these words, "I thank God that the bones of Tom Paine have been rooted up, and no longer disgrace the soil of our country."³ I cannot refrain also from quoting the following, which is a masterpiece of inconsistency. The writer is speaking of Westchester County,

Here is found the delightful village where the pious but persecuted Huguenots, fleeing from oppressions and bigotry and intolerance, found a quiet and happy home; and where too is still pointed out the consecrated little enclosure in which, when the toils and sufferings of this life were over, they rested from their labors. And here, alas! that place should be known but to be shunned, here is yet seen the ruins of the sad and forsaken spot rendered infamous by the sepulcher of the infidel Paine. (Works of T. Paine, Pub. By Wm. Carver, 1830, Preface, p. xii.)

But really what is there in this *Age of Reason* that brought upon the head of its writer the denunciations of

² John White Chadwick, *Economy and Waste: A Sermon*, Charles P. Somerby, 1877. John White Chadwick (1840-1904) was an American writer and Unitarian preacher.

³ Quoted in J. J. Rousseau, *The Theological Works of Thomas Paine*, New York: William Carver, 1830, p. xi.

the Christian community? Nothing so very startling after all. I quote his statement of belief, at least its positive side,

I believe in one God, and no more; and I hope for happiness beyond this life.

I believe the equality of man; and I believe that religious duties consist in doing justice, loving mercy, and endeavoring to make our fellow creatures happy.⁴

His conception of God was far more noble and exalted than the notions prevailing among the rank and file of the clergy who condemned his, and his faith much more sound and unassailable. Why he was ever spoken of as an infidel, one cannot see, unless it be because he really struck home at the vulnerable point in the accepted faith of the day. The following sentence gives us at once a clue to the cause of the unsympathetic treatment which he received at the hands of the clergy, and also shows us the loftiness of his ideas concerning Jesus:

The Christian Theory is little else than the idolatry of the ancient Mythologists, accommodated to the purposes of power and revenue; and it yet remains to reason and philosophy to abolish the amphibious fraud.

Nothing that is here said can apply, even with the most distant disrespect, to the *real* character of Jesus Christ. He was a virtuous and an amiable man. The morality that he preached and practiced was of the most benevolent kind; and though similar systems of morality had been preached by Confucius, and by some of the Greek philosophers, many years before; by the Quakers since; and by many good men in all ages, it has not been exceeded by any.⁵

A very just, and appreciative statement of Jesus, and one which has the merit of being quite free from gush.

Thus it seems that in general Tom Paine held views which are very acceptable today to a very large number of people, and one can express these views without fear of such

⁴ Thomas Paine, *The Age of Reason*, Part I, p. 6.

⁵ Thomas Paine, *The Age of Reason*, Part I, p. 8-9.

painful criticisms as were passed on Paine. The ideas which he advanced represented the opinions of large numbers of people outside of the church. They have, to a very large extent, been taken up into the church beliefs and represent the liberal branches of about all religious bodies, as well as the ideas of those who are openly and avowedly liberal.

Not only do these ideas represent the religious opinions of the American movement outside of the church, but they are the essential principles upon which the American Government was founded. I quote, "The religious opinions of Jefferson, John Adams, Benjamin Franklin and a host of wise and good men in Europe and America differ in no respect from those of Thomas Paine."⁶ With these men Paine was intimate, and in connection with them did much to organize and launch this United States of America upon her course, defending not only political freedom and religious toleration, but insisting upon religious freedom, and the right of private interpretation of religious experience. When we read in our Constitution, "but no religious test shall ever be required as a qualification to any office or public trust under the United States"⁷ it represents the influence of men who were in hearty and cordial sympathy with the ideas of natural religion, which were fundamental with the men of power who framed our Constitution.

This current of religious thought, outside of the church, is one of the most important, if not the most important, in the religious development of the country, and the fulfillment of its prophetic character has been demonstrated each day of our national life.

⁶ I cannot find the source of the quotation.

⁷ United States Constitution, Article VI, Section 3.